

(at 280 persons, itself an achievement), a bibliography, and two examples of latter twentieth century, linear scientific thinking: a twenty-page tabular summarization of the objects in the Lewis collection by location and, more fascinatingly, by “type,” and a fifty-five-page coded listing of Lewis’s photographs.

Welsch’s two-volume set on the Lewis collection is a scholarly achievement that will set the standard for any future work on past Pacific collections. (Kudos to University of Hawai‘i Press, too, for its commitment to publishing so many photographs so well.) From this complex conversation of text, image, and diagram, crossing cultures, paradigms, and eras, we learn about how anthropology and museums have seen, and continue to see, material culture from the Pacific.

ERIC SILVERMAN
DePauw University

* * *

Hunting the Gatherers: Ethnographic Collectors, Agents and Agency in Melanesia, 1870’s–1930’s, edited by Michael O’Hanlon and Robert L. Welsch. *Methodology and History in Anthropology* 6. New York: Berghahn Books, 2000. ISBN 1-57181-811-1; xviii + 286 pages, maps, figures, tables, notes, chapter bibliographies, photographs, index. Cloth, US\$70. Paper, US\$25.

Ethnographic artifacts have long played important roles in the developing discipline of anthropology. Their component materials, crafted surfaces, supposed or documented uses within indigenous cultures, and their histories of exchange have in turn been part of

the vocabulary of ethnographic study. Artifacts, individually and sometimes collectively, have been seen as proof of theories, as illustration of cultural practices, as debate-starters, as rightful compensation, and as unlawful plunder.

The editors of this important study have collected an impressive array of essays constituting an ethnography of artifact collection in the southwestern Pacific over a period of roughly seventy years. Not content just to discuss objects of wood, stone, and fiber, the essayists have ranged widely over the field, and convincingly include photographs and anthropometric measurements as kinds of artifacts. One essay ironically examines an Australian opportunist’s flaunting of western artifacts (including canned goods, other special foods, medical supplies, hardware, and tools) in a bid to impress other expatriates to offer him a permanent position. Disparate as these essays can be, they are held together by the bookends of Michael O’Hanlon’s substantial and well-designed introduction and an insightful epilogue by Nicholas Thomas, whose 1991 *Entangled Objects: Exchange, Material Culture and Colonialism in the Pacific* is acknowledged as one inspiration for this volume. Footnotes and bibliographic citations are copious: the bibliography for the introductory essay alone contains forty-eight items.

O’Hanlon, author of the 1993 *Paradise: Portraying the New Guinea Highlands*, shows how the collecting of artifacts has had changing meanings over the years, tied to issues of representation and local agency.

Helen Gardner explores the juxtaposition of science and religion in

the evangelism-inspired collecting of George Brown, a Methodist missionary to Sāmoa, the Bismarck Archipelago, and later the Trobriands and d'Entrecasteaux Islands. Brown's zealous natural history collecting was endorsed by a Methodist publication that stated: "the chief object of the missionary is to spread the gospel, but he does not forget the claims of science" (37). As Brown's collections expanded into cultural artifacts—at his death the collection contained nearly 3,000 items (49)—Brown wrote a series of anthropological papers and maintained a lively correspondence with many prominent scholars of the day, including Edward B Tylor and Sir William MacGregor. Some of Brown's artifacts helped him and others advance then-novel theories of cultural diffusion in the Pacific, typified by the discussion of artifactual and linguistic differences between Melanesians and Polynesians.

Three essays explore the effects of the "salvage paradigm" on Melanesian collection. Rainer Buschmann surveys the commercialization of ethnography in German New Guinea, chiefly in the operations of the Berlin Museum, the Godeffroy Company, the Neu Guinea Compagnie, and Max Thiel of the Hershheim organization. Buschmann dramatizes these abuses with the example of the "Matty-Mystery." Sir William MacGregor's official collection of artifacts from British New Guinea is the subject of Michael Quinnell's essay. As fans of New Guinea's ubiquitous yellow *Rhododendron macgregoriae* can attest, MacGregor was an honored naturalist as well as an indefatigable administrator, who saw exploration as an "essential tool to promote the extension of govern-

ment control" (82). The history of his New Guinea ethnological collection and its eventual—and complex—repatriation to Papua New Guinea is itself an artifact of changing museum politics. Then, in her essay, Elizabeth Edwards examines the "dense and nuanced" relationships between collecting photographic images and physical objects, as evidenced by a case study of the 1898 Cambridge Torres Strait Expedition's comparative studies in British New Guinea by Haddon, Ray, Seligmann, and Wilkin. Edwards gives helpful background on the changing styles of photography, and shows how the two main styles—"naturalistic, non-interventionist" and the "more controlled, interventionist scientific photography"—came together in this expedition's work. The resulting tensions and ambiguities are palpable and informative in this provocative essay.

Notions of Pygmy mythology that pervaded the characterization of some indigenous peoples discovered—almost always in the highlands—in many colonial lands receives careful treatment by Chris Ballard. His extensive work in Irian Jaya has obviously informed his study of the 1910–1911 British Ornithologists' Union (BOU) expedition to Dutch New Guinea. Like many early scientific forays into the Dutch New Guinea interior, most notably the Archbold expedition of 1938–1939, the BOU expedition was not prepared or equipped for an encounter with a sizable human population: "There is no indication, however, that the study of local communities or the collection of artefacts was intended as anything more than an incidental bonus to the main collection of zoological specimens. At least

three of the members (Wollaston, Rawling, and Grant) carried cameras, and Marshall was equipped with a 'cinematograph camera,' but none of them had any training in the fledgling discipline of anthropology" (137).

On 3 March 1910, and later, from 8–10 November (140–141), on the southern slopes of the Carstenz range, the expedition encountered people they called Tapiro. On the latter occasion, the expedition members "set about documenting the Tapiro, measuring and taking photographs of their bodies, and trading for those artefacts that the Tapiro were willing to relinquish" (140). Significant to the extension of the Pygmy complex in anthropology, of course, was the subsequent anthropological literature and discussion, much of it by A C Haddon. The resulting positions about the diminutive nature of interior New Guinea people would influence the thinking of anthropologists, colonial administrators, and missionaries for many years to come.

Robert L Welsch's essay analyzes three interrelated artifact collections made on New Guinea's north coast in August 1908, which were eventually acquired by Chicago's Field Museum. In discussing this material and its collection by George A Dorsey, Captain H Voogdt, and J F G Umlauff, Welsch employs a perspective that "most collections reflect simultaneously the subtle interplay between the indigenous and collector agendas" (156). He also draws profitably on his considerable experience with the A B Lewis collection, helping weave a story of collecting styles, interactions between collectors, and the sometimes problematic tracing of provenance.

Michael Young offers a sketch of Bronislaw Malinowski's contradictory life as simultaneous collector and critic of "antiquarian relics," documenting some of his correspondence with museums and their curators. Another anthropologist of the era, Felix Speiser, led a change of focus from the biological studies then in vogue, to a study of art styles. This shift, and the attendant struggles within the field, are discussed in Christian Kaufmann's chapter. This discussion echoes to some extent the Pygmy questions raised in an earlier chapter, and also concerns the salvage paradigm. Chris Gosden's essay on John Alexander Todd examines materialism as it appears among westerners, Todd in particular, and his use of his own culture's artifacts to gain prestige and power. This well-documented discussion includes shipping lists of canned food and other supplies that Todd imported to New Britain. Finally, Chantal Knowles's chapter on Beatrice Blackwood examines her narrowing methodological focus and her use of artifacts as gifts to gain respect and consolidate her prestige in several contexts.

This book can be a thought-provoking resource for anthropological researchers in the Pacific, for museum curators, and for serious readers of anthropology who are curious about the complex history of artifacts' changing roles in the social sciences. The issues and concepts ably discussed in *Hunting the Gatherers* are relevant far beyond Melanesia.

LARRY LAKE
Messiah College

* * *