

than invite reform. In this respect their essays constitute a potential resource for the students protesting in Port Moresby, Sumatrans living on the shores of Lake Toba, and Māori communities dispersed throughout New Zealand.

The contributors identify the hidden costs and risks of privatization and other schemes to simplify and homogenize property regimes, yet there is a need to go one step further, to explicitly address arguments for property reform, to promote debate by acknowledging dissenting points of view (all of the authors are in substantial accord here), and to provide more robust efforts to theorize (rather than simply describe and explain) key differences between property regimes. Perhaps in a sequel to this volume the authors might consider formulating concrete proposals for what might work, what mixed and partial strategies—rather than sweeping, one-size-fits-all reforms like that proposed by de Soto—might prove useful to Asian-Pacific communities in the face of economic transformation and globalization. Robust as the traditional property regimes they describe are, they are not necessarily sufficient for defending and promoting local interests today. Harmut Holznecht and others acknowledge this point, noting that land registration can provide an important legal resource in the struggle to defend land rights. Holznecht also stipulates that any such reforms must involve consultation, transparency, and representative proceedings. This volume provides a credible rebuttal of the claim that property reforms necessarily yield economic growth, but the critique is not sufficient; scholars must also con-

sider the implications of their research for the imagination of alternatives beyond the status quo.

STUART KIRSCH
University of Michigan

* * *

Dilemmas of Development: The Social and Economic Impact of the Porgera Gold Mine 1989–1994, edited by Colin Filer. Canberra: Asia Pacific Press (Asia Pacific School of Economics and Management, Australian National University) and Boroko: National Research Institute, 1999. ISBN paper 0-7315-3606-1; xiii + 319 pages, tables, figures, maps, notes, references, index. Paper, A\$20.

Papua New Guinea's Environmental Planning Act requires developers to fund social impact studies as a precondition for mining operations, and the minerals boom of the 1980s and 1990s has also been a boom for social research: for every new mining project, somebody will have written a social impact report. Despite the volume of consulting, however, little of this work has found its way into the mainstream literature. Some of this difficulty may rest with the traditional estrangement between academic and applied research, but much of it lies with the terms of consultancy agreements between researchers and their clients. Developers view consultants' reports as proprietary information and are reluctant to make them public, partly out of nervousness about publicity and partly out of habit: why, after all, should they give away something they spent shareholders' money on?

For this and other reasons, *Dilemmas of Development* breaks important ground in the anthropology of contemporary Papua New Guinea. The editor, Colin Filer, is the former head of the Social and Environmental Studies Division of that country's National Research Institute. From this vantage point he brokered a significant share of the studies carried out on Papua New Guinea's minerals frontier, and one major achievement of the current volume was securing the publication of material that might otherwise have remained in corporate files. What *Dilemmas of Development* makes available is a fascinating look at what consultants' research shows about the effects of the Porgera mine on the people living around it.

The book's core consists of reports by Susanne Bonnell and Glenn Banks, consultants with long local experience. Bonnell focuses on social impact with close attention to women's perspectives. Porgera's mine was established on Ipili land, entailing the displacement of people living within the Special Mining Lease. Once plans for mining were announced, people rushed to establish house and garden sites within the lease area in hopes of claiming a share of the compensation expected to flow from a mining agreement. The outcome was a complex exercise in negotiating cash entitlements and relocation housing. Although the developers, Porgera Joint Venture (PJV), spent far more on these arrangements than anticipated, they inevitably introduced cleavages between haves and have-nots. Families relocated to permanent housing ended up hosting numbers of kin and affines, and the pressure on

housing was intensified by the company's failure to make provision for landowners' children as they grew and married. The impact on domestic life is a textbook case of the unintended consequences of the ameliorative provisions of mining agreements.

Bonnell's review of health and education sheds light on why people in Papua New Guinea so often embrace resource developments, for the minerals boom coincided with the state's retreat from rural services. The decline of government is evident in absent or unpaid staff, deteriorating facilities, and the lack of basic administration. No surprise, then, that one of Porgera's major attractions is the availability of schools and medical services that the government fails to provide. Porgera has become a *de facto* site of sovereignty in the face of the state's ineffectiveness.

A major worry for local people and Porgera Joint Venture alike is the high level of violence fueled by unemployment and a burgeoning black market in alcohol, a situation resistant to increased policing. The lack of basic security has also demoralized public servants and undermined efforts to develop the local township. As Banks points out, this situation has an economic impact: expatriate employees cite local crime in choosing to work on a "fly in, fly out" basis. As a result, a major portion of locally earned wages is spent outside the area. Banks analyzes the flow of cash derived from wages and payments to landowners; additional income derives from PJV contracts with landowners for labor or services. Lump-sum payouts are rapidly dispersed in consumption or gifts, and local investment is mainly in

transportation or trade stores. These ventures rarely succeed, due to lack of business experience; vandalism and robbery are also risks, and successful entrepreneurs insulate themselves by investing profits elsewhere. For the most part, landowners' monetary wealth is insufficient to sustain livelihoods, and subsistence gardening is still a necessity.

However, Porgera remains a wealthy enclave in a poor region and continues to attract people from throughout the mine's hinterland. This influx is arguably the single most important social consequence of mining, a matter addressed by Bonnell, Banks, and Biersack in different ways. Bonnell points out that large numbers of outsiders exacerbate unemployment and foster what she calls the "rent a crowd" phenomenon, a factor in the deterioration of public safety. She also stresses husbands' penchant for polygyny—often with outsiders—as an important source of domestic tensions. Banks is similarly critical, arguing that newcomers have increased pressure on the local subsistence system, leading to an expansion of cultivation into marginal ecological zones. Finally, both Bonnell and Banks demonstrate that the claims of outsiders—whether for death compensation, bridewealth, or informal gifts at each payday's "thank you market"—serve to siphon off significant portions of landowners' wealth.

Yet the status of outsiders and the problems they pose is not simple, and Banks cautions against any facile "insider-outsider" distinction. He reminds readers that Ipili society has always been open and facilitated

mobility through the category of *epo atene*, or "come stay" people. This is a theme taken up in Biersack's excellent theoretical review of Ipili ethnography, which focuses on the interplay between long-established practices and the mining context. For example, Porgera Joint Venture's task in allocating benefits was immediately complicated by the readiness with which local Ipili welcomed others—Ipili, Enga, and Huli—to settle on their land. While the company probably saw these moves as signs of avarice, what such views missed was the hosts' eagerness to bolster their own base of support with new recruits. Porgera Joint Venture's codification of identities to circumscribe entitlements was at odds with the fluid and open nature of Ipili affiliation, a mismatch that gave rise to many further problems for the mining company. Biersack develops this perspective to argue for a reevaluation of the role of outsiders on the local scene. Thus the dispersal of wealth in gifts and various payments resembles the kind of social investment Ipili have always valued, while the polygyny Bonnell so roundly criticizes appears as a means of widening social networks. These developments, then, come to look less like pathologies than the pursuit of long-standing projects with enhanced means. Evaluating such claims is difficult in the light of actors' divergent interests, but such "traditional" social strategies blunt the effects of regional inequalities and may offer more security than a state powerless to curb violence.

John Burton, a veteran consultant, closes out the collection with critical

reflections on consultancy at Porgera. One of his complaints is that consultants' reports have had little impact: internal reporting relegates long-term social monitoring to departments that are out of the corporate loop, and mechanisms for action and feedback are undeveloped. This circumstance results from a limited corporate attention span, with management rarely looking beyond the crisis of the moment. Further instances of myopia are evident in the neglect of available ethnography and the failure to examine linkages between Porgera and surrounding areas. Interestingly, management is much more attentive to environmental fears than to social monitoring, a predilection they share with some of their metropolitan critics.

Taken as a whole, *Dilemmas of Development* has the potential to move debates about mining and local people beyond environmental alarms and stories of indigenous resistance to a consideration of the situation of those who live near a working mine and may have left home to do so. In the process of describing what's actually going on, the book offers a more complicated picture and gives a better idea of what there is to learn. This looks like progress.

DAN JORGENSEN
University of Western Ontario

* * *

Paradise for Sale: A Parable of Nature, by Carl N McDaniel and John M Gowdy. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000. ISBN cloth, 0-520-21864-7; paper, 0-520-22229-6; xiv + 225 pages, illustrations, maps, notes, index. Cloth, US\$45.00; paper, US\$17.95.

The authors of *Paradise for Sale: A Parable of Nature* use the current state of affairs in Nauru—in their view a devastated and unproductive physical environment and irretrievably diminished “native” culture—to extrapolate the 21 square kilometer Pacific island's dire circumstances to Planet Earth as a whole. Simply put, they believe Nauru symbolizes our global island of limited natural resources and distinctive cultures in danger of being overexploited and homogenized by rampant capitalism. Relatedly, the book explores different cultures' worldviews (or “myths”) and examines how seemingly inherent (and mostly unquestioned) cultural cosmologies determine humans' interactions with the natural world and the sustainability of the society in the long term.

Biologist Carl N McDaniel, director of undergraduate environmental science, and economist John M Gowdy, director of the PhD program in ecological economics at Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute have written numerous works focusing on the negative environmental impacts of current economic systems and explored various alternative approaches they feel can lead to greater sustainability. They bring considerable knowledge to the general topics explored in this book.